



## The international perspective of trafficking of human organs

Puja Makhijani

Faculty of Law, Jai Narain Vyas University, Jodhpur, Rajasthan, India

### Abstract

Organ transplant surgery has saved countless lives since its arrival in the 1950s. As the techniques and technologies used in transplant medical improvement, there are increasing positive outcomes for donors and recipients. However, the need for this treatment far surpasses organ accessibility.

The critical requirement for organ transplant a medical procedure has brought about a rewarding, transnational criminal endeavor that enables organ seekers to purchase organs from donors.

While organ trafficking is an internationally recognized problem, and efforts to prevent and restrict it have had limited success, this underground crime is a widespread problem in many parts of the world. Part of the challenge is that many countries, including Canada, do not explicitly ban travel abroad for illegally conducted organ transplant surgery. So far, legislative efforts to fortify government laws identifying with organ trafficking in Canada have been unsuccessful. This paper has discussed about the trafficking of human organs at international level.

**Keywords:** organ, organ trade, trafficking, black market, transplant tourism, transplantation

### Introduction

The worldwide deficiency of organs for transplantation has led to a worthwhile trade in the smuggling of organs or trafficking of people with the end goal of organ transplantation<sup>[1]</sup>. These practices traditionally alluded to as organ trafficking, are disallowed by worldwide law as part of the general ban on human trafficking<sup>[2]</sup>. Government and non-governmental organizations, including medical associations, have agreed in an official announcement that this prohibition includes any transplant where the organ donor receives a financial benefit or comparable benefit from the transaction<sup>[3]</sup>.

Organ trafficking has turned into a worldwide issue. Evaluations recommend that dealt organs represent up to 10% of organ transplants performed around the world, which are safely assessed at US\$840 million to US\$1.7 billion yearly<sup>[4]</sup>. Increasingly, criminal organizations are extending their training to incorporate human trafficking, with an end goal to take advantage of the hole among market interest for organs<sup>[5]</sup>.

In the course of recent many years, in excess of 100 nations have passed enactment to boycott or reinforce existing laws limiting the exchange organs<sup>[6]</sup>. Furthermore, a few legislative and expert bodies have taken progressed drives to control homegrown and worldwide organ transplantation and forestall organ trafficking<sup>[7]</sup>. Taken together, these drives propose professional, regulatory and international law solutions to address an increasingly complex global criminal enterprise.

### Issues in Organ Trafficking

Since its coming during the 1950s, organ transplantation has become progressively normal all throughout the planet as a treatment for patients with terminal organ failure<sup>[8]</sup>. The demand for organs has increased due to consistent advances in medical innovation and transplantation medicine<sup>[9]</sup>. However, the interest for organs far surpasses the inventory.

It is assessed that the current number of legitimate transplants performed to meet the requirements of just 10% of all waiting list patients worldwide<sup>[10]</sup>. The paucity of available organs has prompted countries to develop Procedures and systems to augment supplies, primarily through the improvement, expansion and promotion of deceased donation programs. However, this alone "is not sufficient to fill the hole among request and supply of organs."<sup>[11]</sup>

As the interest for organs exceeds the supply, both transplant professionalism and organ trafficking, which involves the illegal purchase and sale of organs, are on the rise. This pattern has been seen in spite of the way that practically all nations of the world prohibit compensatory organ donation, a practice widely seen as immoral and exploitative and harms the poor and powerless<sup>[12]</sup>. The WHO's core values on human cell, tissue and organ transplantation (discussed in section 4.3 of this background paper) allow compensation for the cost of donating (including medical expenses and lost income for living donors), But restrict payments for organs, which "are likely to unfairly take advantage of the poorest and most vulnerable groups, undermine philanthropic donations, and lead to profiteering and human trafficking."<sup>[13]</sup>

As a result, organs have turned into a significant and beneficial underground market commodity, with international crime syndicates operating "highly organized" networks across public boundaries<sup>[14]</sup>. As per the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), illicit practices associated with the unlawful organ trade are one of the most troublesome wrongdoings to recognize. Subsequently, consciousness of the wrongdoing among criminal equity specialists, law implementation and policymakers stays low, and authorization of the wrongdoing is for the most part not a need, albeit a few locales have enhanced this front<sup>[15]</sup>. This absence of mindfulness exists notwithstanding the sheer number of

entertainers engaged with the illicit organ trade, including a representative who goes about as an intermediary between the organ buyer and seller, the local recruiter who identifies vulnerable people who are involved in their Those willing to sell organs, and medical professionals performing illegal organ removal, and local hospitals <sup>[16]</sup>.

As verified in the prologue to this foundation paper, organ trafficking is assessed to produce between US\$840 million and US\$1.7 billion in illicit benefits each year. A 2017 report by Global Financial Integrity estimated that in 2014, about 12,000 illegal transplants were performed worldwide, two-thirds of which involved the kidney. The same report estimated that an organ buyer could pay anywhere from US\$50,000 to US\$120,000 for a kidney on the black market <sup>[17]</sup>. Meanwhile, sellers receive an average of less than 10% of buyer's payments, most of which goes to traffickers and other middlemen <sup>[18]</sup>. The estimated average billed fee for a kidney transplant is US\$442,500, which includes pre-and post-operative care, as compared with the cost of kidney transplant operations approved in the United States <sup>[19]</sup>. In Canada, in 2019, the first-year cost of a transplant into the health care system was estimated to be \$66,000. Transplant-related costs are estimated to be \$23,000 per year in subsequent years <sup>[20]</sup>.

Cases of organ trafficking occur all over the world. According to UNODC, trafficking for organ removal was recognized in 25 nations somewhere in the range of 2003 and 2016, predominantly in North Africa and the Middle East; however cases have likewise been accounted for in Western, Central and Eastern Europe, just as Central and South America <sup>[21]</sup>. Different pundits have noticed that those most focused on for organ trafficking, commercialization or transplant tourism seem to be vulnerable and poor people in China, Egypt, India, Iraq, Pakistan, and the Philippines, as well as in the countries of Central and South America and Eastern Europe. The victims are mainly men and are between the ages of 20 and 40. They are often misled about the nature and medical consequences of the transplant procedure and several studies show that almost all organ vendors regret doing so. Once admitted, suspected victims are often forced to go through a process of violence or intimidation <sup>[22]</sup>.

On the demand side, the act of voyaging abroad for business inserts has been accounted for among residents of Australia, Canada, Japan, South Korea, the United States, and nations in the Middle East and Western Europe. Organ recipients travelling abroad usually do so in distress due to declining wellbeing and helpless possibilities of obtaining a valid organ transplant in their home country. Recipients can learn about transplant tourism opportunities through verbal exchange or online promotions, among different sources <sup>[23]</sup>. Commercial transplants performed overseas are perilous not just for donors but also for recipients, possibly due to the lack of an administrative structure to guarantee the wellbeing of the technique and organ viability. A study conducted at a Toronto medical clinic somewhere in the range of 1998 and 2013 found that patients who had kidney transplants outside Canada were three to multiple times bind to pass on or lose a limb. As did those who received kidney transplants in Canada and were additionally at higher danger of getting back with sicknesses like hepatitis or tuberculosis, among different inconveniences <sup>[24]</sup>.

Organ trafficking is global in scope and targets specific donor and recipient profiles. Donor countries include

countries in South America, Eastern Europe, and South and East Asia. Recipient countries include Canada, the United States, Australia, also, nations in the Middle East and East Asia. The normal organ donor is a 28-year-old male with a normal yearly pay of \$480, while the commonplace organ beneficiary is a 48-year-old male with a middle yearly pay of \$53,000 <sup>[25]</sup>.

### **Background of human organ trafficking**

Transplantation of human organs has become a successful medical procedure during the last fifteen years. Thousands of critically ill patients are given new life through transplantation of healthy heart, kidney, liver and lungs. Around 300,000 individuals overall get organ transplants each year. Sadly, not very many nations have sufficient organs to address the issues of patients. In the United States, around 50,000 individuals are on waiting lists for transplants, and 15% of patients who need another heart will pass on before one is available <sup>[26]</sup>. The unmatched supply and demand generates a massive global search for potential organ donors. In order to survive, many people – not all of them wealthy – have shown a willingness to travel great distances for safe transplants through legal or illegal channels, even though survival rates are quite low. <sup>[27]</sup>. In contrast, the sellers are all from poor socio-economic backgrounds. They sell their organs to pay off debts, for necessary surgeries, or for other family needs. The most common problems with organ trafficking occur when people agree to sell their organs and enter into formal or informal contracts to do so; However, once the organ (i.e., kidney) is removed, they are not paid at all or only a portion of the initially agreed upon price. Accepting the demands, many surgeons, touts and some government officials have commercialized human organs to profit from the shortage <sup>[28]</sup>. For example, in India, wealthy people and their doctors buy kidneys from debt-ridden Indian villagers <sup>[29]</sup>. In desperation, many individuals also resort to illegal means to obtain organs for transplantation, such as using the black-marketing trade to purchase the organs of executed prisoners. In China, authorities profitably market the organs of executed Chinese prisoners <sup>[30]</sup> and here are more horror stories about organ trafficking <sup>[31]</sup>. Andre, from a town in southern Moldova, was facing difficult economic conditions when a Turkish man came to his village and offered him a large sum of money (about \$2,500–\$3,000) to sell a kidney. Andre finally agreed, and with other Moldovan men he traveled to Turkey. He was kept in the basement lodge for a night and was due to go to the clinic for the operation the next day. Andre said that he lost consciousness during the night and when he woke up the next day, he found that he had been operated on in his sleep and that his kidney had been stolen. Andre reported the matter to the Turkish police, who deported him back to Moldova. He later reported the matter to the local Moldovan police, but due to a lack of clear information about his pimp or the place he had visited in Turkey, there was little the police could do. Andre reported the matter to La Strada Moldova's hotline because he was upset that he had been duped of money and was seeking help locating a Turkish broker.

### **Globalization factors associated with human organ trafficking**

According to Harrison <sup>[32]</sup>, "Human body part trade merely reflects the general system of unequal exchange that

characterizes other forms of trade between developed and underdeveloped regions of the world, and between classes, castes, sexes, etc., within and beyond these regions." Globalization facilitates the process of this exchange.

Now, the rich need not steal the body parts of the poor, they can buy them under a contract law. As a result, the human organ trafficking business continues to grow from individual entrepreneurs to large international collaborations. Trading in human organs is illegal in most countries of the world. Due to the lack of efficient regulations on the human organ trade, then again, the ban on the sale of organs has not restricted trade in the human organ business, but has encouraged trade. This type of questionable trade stems from people's innate desire for longevity and a large pool of supply and demand organs. The inevitable result is a boom in human organ trafficking that caters to wealthy recipients and destitute (sometimes helpless) donors.

It is considered wrong to buy and sell human organs such as kidneys, as it would be unethical to make a profit by commercializing such items. The rejection of organ trafficking is higher in religious countries. Trafficking can flow from countries with more religious restrictions to countries with less religious restrictions. Nevertheless, cultural beliefs about the dignity of the body and sovereign states pose some obstacles to the global market for body parts, but these views have proved fragile under global markets.

#### **Economic globalization and human organ trafficking.**

There are many barriers to international human organ trafficking, including economic, technical and religious sanctions. These barriers are being reduced by the driving forces behind globalization. Economic globalization involves the establishment of a progression of overall trades in labor, trade, innovation and capital between countries.<sup>[33]</sup> The benefits of economic globalization include world economic growth, falling trade barriers, higher living standards, accelerated innovation, spread of technology and management skills, and new economic opportunities for countries. However, economic globalization entails a number of costs, such as increased inequality and greater vulnerability for many individuals (i.e., higher rates of crime, unsafe work environments, and unemployment)<sup>[34]</sup>.

#### **Cultural globalization and human organ trafficking.**

The relationship between cultural globalization and trafficking may be addressed, which may lead to international human organ trafficking. In general, culture includes a variety of ethical and religious issues, which explain the ways in which people live in each culture. There are different types of cultures around the world, and each culture has a unique view of the dignity of the human body. Cultural values influence the decisions of individuals regarding the human body. Some cultural beliefs about the dignity of the body hinder organ transplantation<sup>[35]</sup>.

#### **International organ trafficking**

International discrimination and stigma against individuals and groups in the health environment are consistently reported. In 2014, the International Bioethics Committee (IBC) of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) published *an IBC report on the principle of non-discrimination and non-stigma*<sup>[36]</sup>. As indicated by this report, the process of discrimination

and stigma continues unabated. From one viewpoint, these two peculiarities are found in worldwide repeating issues like ignored tropical sicknesses, HIV/AIDS, organ gift and trafficking; then again, they go to the front in new advancements, for example, bio-banks, nanotechnology and neuroscience<sup>[37]</sup>.

The reality and necessity of global bioethics and the continuing talk on segregation and disgrace are clear when alluding to worldwide organ trafficking. In most cases, along with other moral issues, this illegal practice is innately oppressive, and in many examples, participants are stigmatized, as the IBC's in-depth study clearly shows. In his new thesis, which concentrates on organ trafficking as a social issue in Israel, Shidlo-Hezroni likewise shows that the training is biased and stigmatizing in nature<sup>[38]</sup>. There is no question discrimination and stigma in legal organ donation programs, but this article centers around trafficking. In the mid-eighties, another type of illegal exploitation created as a worldwide peculiarity in the Middle East, Latin America and Asia, specifically the worldwide trafficking in the kidneys of living people<sup>[39]</sup>. It is acknowledged that ~5 - 10% of all kidneys transplanted since that time may be linked to organ trafficking. Kidney (and other organs) trafficking is found today in more than 50 countries around the world. It happens that 'medical tourists' from rich countries grab organs in poor countries. Organ vendors are often sent to wealthy nations to go through the important procedures there. In 2004, a syndicate that moved patients and organ vendors from Brazil to South Africa (SA) for kidney transplantation in SA was uncovered<sup>[40]</sup>.

Although organ trafficking is a global issue and is prohibited by most countries, global efforts have not been successful in curbing the practice, especially because the involvement of multiple countries in the same incident complicates prosecution. A strong doubt exists that organ trafficking is expanding each year; this idea is reinforced by ongoing newspaper reports to which this review alludes. Any search on Twitter with the keyword 'organ trafficking' confirms the suspicion and reality of this global problem. The causes of organ trafficking are: Shortage of organs; Lack of postmortem donation practice; Packages by some medical fund organizations to cover transplant procedures overseas (for example, the USA), a highly profitable practice; obedient medical personnel; cost of kidney dialysis; Absence of public and global guideline and implementation of existing laws; and the supposed inclusion of legislatures<sup>[41]</sup>. Organizations and middlemen associated with the mafia have appeared and they have used this freedom to target weak people, thereby increasing the black market rapidly. Accurate and recent information on the matter is scarce, as the practice is illegal and underground. The doubt is that the degree of the issue is belittled; therefore, trafficking in illegal organs is not expected to end anytime soon.

#### **Conclusion**

Organ trafficking is a developing worldwide peculiarity that not just has exploitative consequences, but is discriminatory and stigmatizing as far as it can be ascertained. There is no public or worldwide announcement that oddballs and battles organ trafficking in view of the biased and defaming results of the medical practice included. The UDBHR addresses the problem of organ trafficking (Article 21.5) for discrimination and stigma (Article 11). Until a global

declaration and a related project come into force, the UDBHR can be utilized as an authority appeal to the world community to cooperatively combat these activities.

Nevertheless, this study is only the first step in the exploration of international human organ trafficking. In conclusion, this study shows that scholars still have many opportunities to investigate more factors associated with organ trafficking, as well as the impacts of human organ trafficking on the global community.

Organ trafficking is a worldwide issue that continues to a great extent undetected in spite of mesh critical benefits for organized wrongdoing gatherings. All nations are impacted – the casualties of organ trafficking are regularly found among poor and weak populaces in non-industrial nations, while the beneficiaries of illegal organs are normally from more well off nations like Canada. Organ trafficking is fuelled by a huge absence of organs accessible by genuine means in practically all locales, remembering for Canada where patients can hang long time for transplant.

### References

1. Sonya Norris, Organ Donation and Transplantation in Canada: Statistics, Trends and International Comparisons, Publication no. 2020-28-E, Parliamentary Information and Resource Service, Library of Parliament, Ottawa, 2020, 5-6.
2. “Human trafficking” is defined to include exploitation for the purpose of the removal of organs. See United Nations [UN] General Assembly, Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime [Palermo Protocol], 2000. art. 3(a).
3. The Declaration of Istanbul on Organ Trafficking and Transplant Tourism, 2018. Edition.
4. Ibid, p. 1; and Channing May, Transnational Crime and the Developing World, Global Financial Integrity, 2017, 29.
5. UNODC, 2015, 11.
6. Fikresus Fikrejesus Amahazion, “Human rights and world culture: The diffusion of legislation against the organ trade,” *Sociological Spectrum*, 2016:36(3):158-182.
7. See, for example, Council of Europe, Council of Europe Treaty Series - No. 216: Council of Europe Convention against Trafficking in Human Organs, 25, 2015.
8. Sarah Shepp, “Priceless Kidney: The Ineffectiveness of Organ Trafficking Legislation,” *Syracuse Journal of International Law and Commerce*, Vol. 46, No. 2, Spring, 2019:46:2:384.
9. Canadian Institute for Health Information, “Despite progress, Canada’s organ supply still isn’t meeting demand,” News release, 2019. European Parliament, Directorate-general for External Policies, Policy Department, Trafficking in human organs, 2015, 18.
10. Stefania Negri. “Transplant Ethics and the International Crime of Organ Trafficking,” *International Criminal Law Review*, 2016:16(2):288.
11. Ambagtsheer F, Weimar W. “A Criminological Perspective: Why Prohibition of Organ Trade is Not Effective and How the Declaration of Istanbul Can Move Forward,” *American Journal of Transplantation*, 2012:12,(3):573.
12. Declaration of Istanbul – 2018 Edition, “Preamble,” p. 1. The WHO first declared the prohibition of organ trade during the 40<sup>th</sup> World Health Assembly in 1987, later adopting resolution WHA44.25 at the 44<sup>th</sup> World Health Assembly in 1991. See Global Observatory on Donation and Transplantation, Resolution WHA44.25 endorsing the 1991 Guiding Principles.
13. WHO. “Commentary on Guiding Principle 5,” 2010, 5.
14. UNODC, Global Report on Trafficking in Persons 2018, Vienna, 2018, 30-31.
15. UNODC, 2015, 13.
16. European Parliament, 2015, 20-21.
17. May. It is not possible to obtain accurate and up-to-date figures on the number of organs that are trafficked each year due to the secrecy of the trade, 2017, 29.
18. Ibid, 30.
19. T. Scott Bentley and Nick J. Ortner, 2020 U.S. organ and tissue transplants: Cost estimates, discussion, and emerging issues, Milliman Research Report, 2020, 3.
20. Kidney Foundation of Canada, “The Kidney Foundation of Canada statements regarding the 2019 Federal Budget,” News release, 2019.
21. UNODC, 2018, 30.
22. Marta López-Fraga *et al.* “Human trafficking for the purpose of organ removal,” Chapter 10 in Ryszard Piotrowicz, Conny Rijken and Baerbel Heide Uhl, eds., *Routledge Handbook of Human Trafficking*, Routledge International Handbooks, 2017:120:124.
23. European Parliament, 2015, 20.
24. Ramesh Prasad GV *et al.* “Commercial kidney transplantation is an important risk factor in long-term kidney allograft survival,” *Kidney International*, See also Tom Blackwell, “Canadian ‘transplant tourists’ putting their lives at serious risk: study,” *National Post*, 2016:89(5):1119-1124.
25. European Parliament, Trafficking in human organs (1.48 MB, 75 pages), 2015, 19.
26. Rothman D. ‘Ethical and Social Consequences of Selling a Kidney’, *JAMA*, 2002:288:13.
27. Scheper-Hughes N. ‘The Global Traffic in Human Organs’, *Current Anthropology*, 2000:41(2):191-224.
28. Baker, Peter. ‘In Struggling Moldova, Desperation Drives Decisions; Europe’s Poorest Country Is Major Source of Human Organ Sellers and Women Lured to Sexual Slavery,’ *Washington Post*, 2002. [available at <http://www.washingtonpost.com/ac2/wp-dyn/A206022002Nov6?language=printer>].
29. Ahmed RZ. ‘India Might Be World’s Leading Human Organ Market’, *Times News Network*, 2002.
30. Elvin J. ‘World Trade and Blac-Market Body Parts in China’, *Insight*, 2001.
31. GTZ. *Coercion in the Kidney Trade? A Background Study on Trafficking in Human Organs Worldwide*, 2004.
32. Harrison T. ‘Globalization and the Trade in Human Body Parts’, *CRSA*, 1999:36(1):22.
33. Stubbs R, Underhill GR. *Political Economy and the Changing Global Order*, ed. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1994.
34. Wallach L, Sforza M. *Whose Trade Organization? Corporate Globalization and the Erosion of Democracy*, Washington: Public Citizen Foundation, 1998.
35. Scheper-Hughes N. ‘The Global Traffic in Human Organs’, *Current Anthropology*, 2000:41(2):191-224.

36. International Bioethics Committee of United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. Report on the Principle of Non-discrimination and Non-stigmatisation. Paris: UNESCO, 2014.
37. Bagheri A. The risk of discrimination and stigmatisation in organ transplantation and trafficking. In: Bagheri, A, Moreno J, Semplici S, eds. Global Bioethics: The Impact of the UNESCO International Bioethics Committee, Advancing Global Bioethics, 5. Cham, Switzerland: Springer International Publishing, 2016.
38. Shidlo-Hezroni V. Organ Trafficking: The Construction of a Social Problem in Israel. ProQuest Information and Learning, 2016. [https://indigo.uic.edu/bitstream/handle/10027/19534/Shidlo-Hezroni\\_Vered.pdf?sequence=1](https://indigo.uic.edu/bitstream/handle/10027/19534/Shidlo-Hezroni_Vered.pdf?sequence=1)
39. Scheper-Hughes N. Human Traffic: Exposing the Brutal Organ Trade. New Internationalist, 2014. <https://newint.org/features/2014/05/01/organ-traffickingkeynote/#footnote-2-ref>
40. Ten Have H. Bioethiek Zonder Grenzen: Mondialisering van Gezondheid, Ethiek en Wetenschap. Antwerpen: Valkhof Pers, 2011 a.
41. Okunola D. Gov Okorocho Implicated in Human Trafficking Mess. 2016. <https://www.naij.com/720362-governor-rochas-okorocho-alleged-involved-human-organ-trafficking.html>